

Please refer to this document for a variety of Public Comment pieces, facts, quotes, and article and video links to further expand on the need for a full ivory trade ban. For any specific questions, please do not hesitate to contact me at any time as ashley96@aya.yale.edu

Thank you!

National Geographic article featuring critical role of Vermont:

<http://news.nationalgeographic.com/2015/04/150407-ivory-trade-vermont-usfws-victor-gordon-cities-nra/>

Possible videos for viewing:

<https://youtu.be/UCBjjdYH-io>

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=gQelgbDlhuw>

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5gQujyNDp98>

http://education.nationalgeographic.com/education/media/trafficking-poached-ivory/?ar_a=1

<http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-3001494/Shot-helicopters-hacked-death-chainsaws-Soldiers-bloodthirsty-African-warlord-Joseph-Kony-murder-elephants-record-rate-single-tusk-traded-18-000-bullets.html> (Kony's Ivory video)

<http://video.pbs.org/video/2336802391/>

Partner Organizations in Support of Full State Bans:

Animal Welfare Institute
Endangered Species Coalition
Animals Asia
Alliance for Animals and the Environment
Ban Ivory Save Elephants
Born Free USA
Burn the Ivory
CA4Elephants
Center for Biological Diversity
Connecticut Votes for Animals
Dazzle Africa
Deanna's Restaurant l'ville
Elephant Advocacy
Elephantopia
Elephant DaZe
Elephants LA
Elephant Nature Park
Hong Kong for Elephants
Humane Society International
iWorry
Kenyans United Against Poaching
Labyrinth Books, Princeton
Lambertville House Inn
Lambertville Station
LuLu Lemon Clothing, Princeton
March for Elephants
Global March for Elephants and Rhinos
Performing Animal Welfare Society
Princeton Community TV
Pro-Wildlife
Save All Endangered Elephants
Social Compassion
The Antique Jungle in Lambertville
The David Sheldrick Wildlife Trust
The Humane Society of Canada
The Humane Society of the United States
The Jane Goodall Institute
The Organic View
The People's Store in Lambertville
Tusk Task Force
Vermont Humane Federation
WildAid
Wildlife Conservation Society
WildlifeDirect

Email of support from fellow Shelburne, VT resident:

Elephants

Danielle Gilbert-Richard (dgilbertrichard@icloud.com)

[Add to contacts](#)

3/31/15

Hi Ashley- I saw an article in the shelburne news regarding your visit to the school and promotion of the ivory ban in the state of Vermont. I have been so sad and distraught about the cruelty to the elephants and desperate to do something to help. Besides giving money to Ifaw, 96 elephants, the gallman foundation and world wildlife fund to support anti poaching efforts I am not sure what else I can do. If there is anything that I can support locally or help with I would be happy to do so. I live in shelburne and work for Merrill lynch, as a financial advisor. I graduated from the school of natural resources at uvm in 96 and have always been a lover of and advocate for animals. My husband and son and I are planning a trip to Africa in a couple of years to carry out a dream of ours to see these beautiful animals and many more in their natural environment. Thanks so much for all that you have done and continue to do. Best, Danielle Gilbert-

Email from Kathy Romano showing NJ antique stores have not suffered from full ban:

I do not feel that sale of ivory accounts for any significant number. We haven't carried it for years, and no loss.

The younger collector won't buy it either for lack of interest

in carved ivory or their awareness of the plight of elephants. I feel that ivory has had its heyday thankfully

and some people who collected it may feel that the ban

will leave them no outlet. But , oh well, we have collections

of antiques that we can no longer sell because they too, have seen their heyday. So we lose money too. They have to get over it move on and don't take it out on innocent

elephants .

Email from Safari Operator in Africa:

----- Original message -----

From: Preston Safari <prestonsafaris@yahoo.com>

Date:04/04/2015 11:02 AM (GMT-08:00)

To: Ruth Musgrave <rmusgrave@comcast.net>

Subject: Re: Elephant poaching and ivory sales

Jambo Ruth,

Poaching of elephants has caused a huge impact on tourism for many years. Tourism which is the number one source of revenue for Kenya has drastically gone down due to poaching. We have had lots of booking cancellations when tourists are told via wildlife magazines and also the internet about elephants killings.

I have not run into poachers because they hide when they notice a vehicle approaching. They are not after the tourists but the elephants. I have many times run into dead elephants on safari which were slaughtered by poachers some of which we had seen and filmed the previous day. As a result many of my guests promised never to return after seeing the dead elephants.

In my business i lost several professional photographers who used to return every year when they learned slaughter of very well known elephants which had huge tusks.

Many other guides working on different safari companies share the same of having their guest refuse to return.

These guest after returning back to their countries share photos of dead elephants they took with others planning to visit Kenya and many cancelled their safaris. The impact on tourists is huge since poaching started, this also applies to my business and other safari companies in Kenya.

Many local people have lost their jobs in tourism sector due to many cancellations. Others affected are curio shops, farmers, sale of safari vehicles, community visits by tourists and many more. This is a big impact to local people.

Poaching is a rampant issue that needs to be dealt with much vigour and strictness.

Thanks,
Preston.

New Jersey letters of support from antique store owners,

James J. Castelli, Owner, the People's Store, one of the largest antique stores in tri-state area, based in NJ and **Tony & Kathy Romano**, Owners, The Antique Jungle

BILL H. 297

March 24, 2015

Dear Representative David L. Deen

We are antique dealers with partnership interests in the Lafayette Mill Antique Center, a NJ antique center in existence for over thirty years. We are also affiliated with the Peoples Store Antique Center in Lambertville, NJ and participate in antique shows in various locales.

We would like to address the compelling bill H 297 that you are sponsoring. We applaud you and thank you for your leadership. You are truly making a difference. We must triumph, because the killing of these innocent, majestic, helpless elephants for the sake of carving trinkets, statues, and incidental objects, is so unethical and cruel and must STOP! Their tusks are theirs, they are not a product for us to steal. The elephant faces total extinction by 2025, only eleven years from now, at the current rate of poaching!

After speaking to many antique dealers, and explaining this tragedy taking place before our very eyes, we have the support of the majority of the antique dealers. They have just been waiting for direction. Many dealers weren't aware of the fact that elephants are being poisoned and gunned down by notorious poachers to turn a profit. Antique dealers assume that they are purchasing antique ivory when they have the opportunity to buy. Now we know how ivory can be made to appear to be antique. They feel that the total banning of ivory in each state will provide the clarity, which presently is unclear. We want no part in the bloody ivory trade that will cause the extinction of these wonderful creatures who have roamed the earth for millions of years.

A less impassioned reason to totally ban the sale of ivory in Vermont and in the United States is that it funds terrorism as stated by the State Department.

The total ban on the sale of ivory in New Jersey has not affected the bottom line of the antique dealers in New Jersey in relation to the tragedy of the extinction of the elephant. It is such a small percentage of ones sales unless one is importing illegal NEW ivory in bulk. Those are the people who will feel the pain in their pocket. They are illegally importing ivory into New York and New Jersey, camouflaging it as antique. The sale of carved wood, bone, and synthetic objects can quench the thirst of the buyers who want hand carved items, without causing the demise of this endangered species.

We have found that styles and collections change from year to year. Ivory objects are not in demand because people are more aware of how ivory is obtained and at what expense. People who shop in our stores, applaud us for passing the law in New Jersey and find no problem in buying objects that can satisfy their tastes.

If you've ever seen a baby elephant slowly die after his mother was killed by poachers, for lack of food and water and not knowing how to survive, you come to the realization that we can leave no stone unturned, no avenue untraveled, no challenge left behind, in order to win this battle.

These elephants are mothers and fathers, aunts and uncles, just as we are. They deserve better.

The total ban of the sale of ivory in Vermont will not negatively impact their way of life economically.

It will give our industry more credibility and backbone and provide the clarity that we all long for.

Fight to make the world a better place. Isn't that what its all about?

Sincerely,

Tony & Kathy Romano
The Antique Jungle

Lafayette Antique Center
Peoples Store Lambertvill NJ

Dear State Representative Jim McCullough,

Thank you for reaching out. Yes we ban selling everything with Ivory, even vintage instruments. The vintage instruments I have in my personal collection with Ivory will now be passed down to future generations instead of sold. There are other things to invest in and collect that don't involve murder.

We hope the people of Vermont feel the same.

Sincerely,

James Castelli

jcastelli@PeoplesStore.net

www.PeoplesStore.net

www.StoneHouse1814.com

Re: BILL H. 297

March 19, 2015

Dear Representative David L. Deen

The legislation addressing the state bill (BILL H.297) to outlaw the ivory trade is of paramount interest to me. First of all I would like to thank you for your leadership on trying to pass the bill to ban all ivory sales in Vermont. As The General Manager of one of the largest antique stores in the tri-state area, we are glad to finally see this major issue being taken seriously. We have around 50 dealers on 4 floors in our main building, which has been an antiques center for over 60 years. We also own another Antique Center up the road. The ivory ban did not affect our business since it's only a small part of sales. We feel it's awful to sell something in our stores that an innocent elephant was murdered for. The past few years we have noticed more Asian buyers coming in looking for ivory and we want no part of this. We have banned all ivory sales in our stores even before the law passed in New Jersey and now want to partner with you on getting this bill passed to do the same for Vermont and hopefully the same for the United States. Many of the auction houses around us have already banned ivory from their sales and inventory. It's the ethical thing to do, but we need your help in passing this bill.

The antiques & design industry is about reusing items, making less of an impact on the environment, buying from local designers. The antiques industry is not about murder, torture and the extinction of one of the most docile creatures on the planet. Ivory tusks are theirs, and not ours to sell.

The bill banning ivory should be welcomed by antique dealers in Vermont since it will provided clarity where right now the law is unclear. We have all witnessed ivory coming in our stores as antiques, but very few are antique. Most of the ivory that shows up in antique shops is new ivory made to look old. The current law won't change anything with the ivory trade, and the elephant hunt will continue. The only solution would be to ban all ivory sales, which will stop the horrific killing of elephants and stop funding terrorism.

Thank you for helping the world become a better place, one state at a time.

Sincerely,

James J Castelli

the People's Store

28 North Union Street

Lambertville NJ 08530

Cell: 908-448-7839

E-Mail: jcastelli@PeoplesStore.net

www.PeoplesStore.net

www.StoneHouse1814.com

PS: Antique dealers had plenty of notice. Ivory was a nationally known issues since the mid-1980's, and now it's time to do something about this and change the law. Please help, the elephants are worth it.

Quotes from world-renowned experts pertaining to Vermont's role in the crisis:

"The only way to save elephants is to kill the demand for ivory. We must ban all buyers and traders in every country permanently if we are to save this magnificent species. State bans without any exemptions are critical to ending demand in the USA and to accelerating global awareness about the problem. We are hugely grateful for the support of the USA in saving Africa's elephants." Paula Kahumbu, *Executive Director, WildlifeDirect*

*Paula's recent article at end of this document.

"Ivory buyers may not be directly killing elephants, but by not buying ivory, they can directly stop the killing of elephants. State by state bans are a critical means of crushing demand and saving elephants." Richard Leakey, Internationally renowned paleontologist and founder of WildlifeDirect

BORN FREE reports:

We would also like to submit our reports on the ivory trade for the record. The first, *Ivory's Curse*, looks at the elephant poaching crisis in Africa from a foreign policy and defense angle. The authors found that the illegal ivory trade is intrinsically linked with political instability in central Africa. Terrorist organizations and organized crime syndicates use poaching as a substantial source of funding for their activities. The report can be accessed on our website (there is a link to the PDF): http://www.bornfreeusa.org/a9_ivorys_curse.php

We also released a second phase of the report over the summer, written by the same defense analysts. *Out of Africa* explores the shipping routes and sites of greatest demand for ivory once it leaves the hands of poachers. (http://www.bornfreeusa.org/a9_out_of_africa.php).

Best,

Rosalyn

Rosalyn Morrison

Program Associate

Born Free USA

P.O. Box 32160 | Washington, DC 20007

Cell: (916) 642-3678

Email: rosalyn@bornfreeusa.org | Web: www.bornfreeusa.org

Media Links from 2013 Battle for the Elephants Event at UVM

BFP Cover: <http://www.burlingtonfreepress.com/apps/pbcs.dll/article?AID=2013310200027>

BFP from day of event:

<http://www.burlingtonfreepress.com/apps/pbcs.dll/article?AID=2013310150002>

WCAX piece:

<http://www.wcax.com/story/23699924/vermont-elephant-expert-discusses-poaching-and-illegal-ivory-sales>

PDF poster and press release are attached and the UVM Communications link that can be used for Facebook posts, Twitter feeds, etc. is as follows:

<http://www.uvm.edu/~uvmpr/?Page=news&storyID=16974>

VPR interview:

<http://tinyurl.com/k6apftr>

US Fish & Wildlife :

Service director Dan Ashe has commented that “The U.S. market is contributing to the crisis now threatening the African elephant. The largely unregulated domestic trade in elephant ivory has served as a loophole that gives cover for illegal trade.”[2]

John Kerry Quote:

“Certainly, even if we aren’t today thinking much about the global implications of poaching in Africa, I can guarantee that we will be if it goes unabated. How shockingly destructive and historically shameful it would be if we did nothing while a great species was criminally slaughtered into extinction. And yet, here we are in the midst of one of the most tragic and outrageous assaults on our shared inheritance that I’ve seen in my lifetime—where an elephant’s dead ivory is prized over its living condition, where corruption feeds on its body and soul, and where money only makes matters worse.” — senator John Kerry, Statement at the Senate Foreign Relations Committee Hearing on Ivory and Insecurity: The Global Implications of Poaching in Africa, May 24, 2012.

Aljazeera article:

<http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/opinion/2015/01/ivory-trade-kills-people-20151865914791719.html>

If you buy ivory, you kill people.

This is the new reality in an illicit trade responsible for large-scale human exploitation, government corruption, and the funding of rebel movements, terrorists, and criminal syndicates around the world. The imagery and narrative of the global ivory trade is now well known - replete with rotting elephant carcasses littering African national parks, well-tailored ministers and heads of state burning ivory stocks for the camera, and law enforcement officials smiling in front of ship containers of seized ivory.

A quote from Dr. Andy Dobson:

At present, we are facing the genocide of Africa’s elephants. Anybody who buys any sort of ivory is enhancing the risk that future generations will live in a world without elephants. Trade in any form of elephant products increases the demand for more elephants to be killed.

Andy Dobson is a professor at Princeton University. He has taught courses on conservation biology and population ecology and has worked on elephants and the ivory trade for more than 25 years.

His full letter is here:

http://www.nj.com/opinion/index.ssf/2014/07/opinion_a_dead_elephant_is_a_dead_elephant_is_a_dead_elephant.html

Another quote from NJ's Senate sponsor:

" This victory is the first ripple of what will be, if I have anything to do with it - and I will - a tidal wave that will spread across America and throughout the world that will protect these creations of God," said Sen. Ray Lesniak, the bill's Senate sponsor.

Billy Joel statement:

To Whom It May Concern: Bill To Fight Illegal Ivory

Jun 18, 2014

To whom it may concern:

I wholeheartedly support the ivory sales ban bill pending in New York State.

I am a piano player. And I realize that ivory piano keys are preferred by some pianists.

But a preference for ivory keys does not justify the slaughter of 96 elephants every day.

There are other materials which can be substituted for piano keys.

But magnificent creatures like these can never be replaced.

Music must never be used as an excuse to destroy an endangered species.

Music should be a celebration of life - not an instrument of death.

Billy Joel

<http://www.longisland.com/news/06-17-14/bill-to-fight-illegal-ivory-and-rhinoceros-horn-trade.html>

'We don't buy panda products - so the Chinese should get their hands off our elephants'

by Paula Kahumbu, CNN

April 7, 2015

Kenyan conservationist Paula Kahumbu is the Executive Director of WildlifeDirect and heads the "Hands Off Our Elephants" campaign. The opinions expressed in this commentary are solely hers.

(CNN)Elephants could be extinct in the wild within a few decades, leading experts warned late last month in Botswana at the Kasane Conference on the Illegal Wildlife Trade, which gathered 150 delegates from countries that are sourcing, transiting and demanding ivory.

The participants signed onto 15 new commitments to stop the slaughter of elephants which have been hailed as significant not only for Africa but globally.

Yet, some conservationists feel unless China -- the leading consumer of ivory -- commits to ending the ivory trade, elephants will be doomed.

Disgust, shame and horror

I am one of them. I started working on elephant conservation when I was a teenager at the National Museums of Kenya. My job was to measure every piece of ivory in the national stockpile.

After two weeks of handling thousands of blood encrusted tusks, I was persuaded that the time for elephants was up.

I had already seen the photographs of mutilated elephants on the headlines of our local newspapers, but now I had the scientific proof that poachers had been gunning down most adult elephants, and were also taking down baby elephants with tusks no more than six inches long.

I remember the disgust, shame and horror I felt at what was happening to an animal that I had never even seen in the wild.

Progress and regress

My boss, renowned conservationist Richard Leakey, put up a spirited fight and shocked the world by setting the entire Kenyan ivory stockpile alight -- the world rallied around Kenya, elephants were listed

on Appendix I of the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES) and trade in ivory was banned globally.

Within months, legal and illegal ivory markets collapsed and the price of ivory plummeted. At that time Japan was the major consumer and everyone said they could not be moved because the use of ivory was rooted in their culture. They were wrong. The demand for ivory collapsed and poaching of elephants and trafficking of ivory declined sharply and elephant numbers began to recover.

Over the next 25 years, elephant populations seemed safe and conservationists heaved a huge sigh of relief.

But international agencies, including some major conservation NGOs, and the International Union for the Conservation of Nature began to suggest that some elephant populations did not deserve to be on Appendix I -- and they even supported renewed sales of ivory.

The first "experimental one-off sale" took place to Japan in 2002. Although the ivory markets in Japan were fairly small, and the controls in that country good, conservationists warned that opening up partial ivory trade was sending the wrong signals, and that it would trigger a demand that could not be contained.

And that is exactly what happened after a second "one-off sale" to China took place in 2008.

Kenya fought valiantly to stop these sales from happening. I headed the Kenyan delegation in 2000 and 2002 and I remember the intense debates at CITES in which the Kenya delegation sought to win global sympathy and support -- "with due respect to our sister from Kenya," the Zimbabwean delegate said, "she is just too emotional." Their argument was that the southern African countries had valuable ivory stocks, and the sale would not affect the rest of Africa. They promised that the funds would be ploughed back into elephant conservation.

To assuage the fears of Kenya, Mali and many other countries, it was agreed that if the ivory sales caused any spike in poaching, CITES would shut down the markets. It was faulty thinking from the start -- you could not shut down a sale after it had happened. Nevertheless, millions of dollars were spent

(mostly on western expatriates) to create a monitoring system now called MIKE (the Monitoring of Illegal Killing of Elephants).

Out of control

Now, 12 years after that first one-off sale, which is just one fifth of the lifetime of an elephant, poaching is out of control and elephant populations are plummeting towards extinction.

In response to the escalating poaching, some countries have strengthened their law enforcement through private and public efforts. In Kenya, there is a new punitive law, increased numbers of rangers and suspected ivory kingpins are being arrested. The poaching is down, but we are fully aware that we're only scratching the surface.

Every African country has its own independent strategy and government responses are slow and clumsy. Yet, poachers and dealers are smart, know the loopholes and the means to corrupt officials.

We know that we cannot save elephants when the demand for ivory continues to rise in Asia. We know that the demand must be extinguished but no one dares to ask for this. It requires the Chinese government to be a friend to Africa and it requires courage.

'Hands off our elephants'

We do not have time to politely persuade the generations of buyers to give up their addiction for ivory. The only solution is a permanent ban on domestic and international trade in ivory across the world.

My Chinese friends warn me that their government is stubborn, and that China will only follow actions of other countries -- two months after the U.S. crushed six tons of ivory, China crushed 6.1 tons of ivory.

It made no difference whatsoever.

I am sick of all the repeated mistakes we keep making with the Chinese in an effort to not offend. The Chinese are waging a war against Africa by decimating our elephant herds. They are using the force of

their economy to threaten us. We cannot afford to respond with politeness. We must defend what is ours and express ourselves clearly about elephants now.

We don't buy panda products, they should get their hands off our elephants.

<http://www.cnn.com/2015/04/07/opinions/paula-kahumbu-china-ivory-elephants-extinction/>